

Stepping off the undergraduate graduation stage and into the choral rehearsal hall comes with mixed emotions: excitement and nervousness, joy and anxiety. The hard work, late-night study sessions, and countless hours of practice has paid off, but the true work has just begun. Regardless of the structure, duration, or rigor of the music education degree in hand, we can all agree there are some realities in the classroom that we cannot prepare for or anticipate. This is complicated exponentially by the sudden removal of a “guardian angel”—a college professor or practicum mentor teacher observing our every move in the classroom providing feedback and guidance. The first few years of teaching and conducting are an exciting time with endless opportunities and the freedom to make your mark on your school, church, or community. However, it can also come with feelings of insecurity, self-doubt, and uncertainty in the future.

While this may seem daunting, we find comfort in the reminder that one of our greatest resources is each other. The guardian angel college professor is an e-mail or a phone call away. The student teaching cooperating teacher continues to be a mentor but now is also a colleague. Former classmates are now experiencing similar situations and issues. The learning does not, and should not, stop after graduation. We can continue to improve our skills and grow our network of peers and mentors.

Reflecting on my first few years as a public school choir director, I offer the following advice for early-career conductors: (a) get involved with your local and state ACDA chapter, (b) attend conferences and professional development interest sessions, (c) ask the advice of mentors in your field, and (d) keep in touch with why you chose this career. Additionally, one of the most impactful decisions I made as a young conductor was to seek out and attend intensive choral conducting workshops to continue the development of my skills as a musician and leader. Through these experiences, I gained more than technical skills or rehearsal tips. I grew as a musician and gained friendships and connections that last to this day.

MAKING THE CASE

THE BENEFIT OF INTENSIVE CONDUCTING WORKSHOPS FOR EARLY-CAREER CHORAL CONDUCTORS

BY JOHN MCDONALD

Interviews with Daniel Bara, Deanna Joseph,
Pamela Elrod Huffman, and Eugene Rogers

John McDonald
Assistant Professor of Music Education
McKendree University - Lebanon, Illinois
jtmcdonald@mckendree.edu

“There is no end to learning.”

—Robert Schumann¹

In this article, I want to encourage early-career choral conductors to adopt a philosophy of lifelong learning through a variety of professional development opportunities. Interest sessions and conference master classes are invaluable to the learning and development of conductors at any stage. However, intensive workshops can provide a more in-depth and well-rounded experience that more closely resembles the collegiate instructional format. These opportunities allow participants to learn from nationally recognized conductor educators, learn an array of new repertoire, build a network of peers, and stay in touch with current trends in choral music.

Researchers in the field of teacher development have identified key elements of design and implementations that render effective and successful teacher education programs. This research, summarized by Laura DeSimone, indicates that effective professional development includes instruction that is content-related, specific to the curriculum and not “one-size-fits-all,” and provides opportunities for active learning.² Alfredo Bautista and his fellow researchers summarize active learning in professional development as “when teachers are engaged in exploration, reflection and discussion, and with contexts for collective participation and collegial sharing.”³ Additionally, high-quality professional development also includes opportunities for constructive feedback.⁴ Intensive conducting workshops clearly encompass these qualifiers.

To explore and explain the benefit of intensive learning opportunities for early-career choral conductors, I interviewed the directors of three different workshops, listed below. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, many workshops and conferences are making the effort to move to an online medium. Even in this new format, workshops hold the same value and create connections across geographic barriers.

Editor’s note: Each year the April issue of the *Choral Journal* includes a listing of summer festivals and workshops to explore for continued learning. You can also contact your state or region ACDA leaders for local recommendations.

Atlanta Summer Conducting Institute

Daniel Bara, Director of Choral Activities and Professor of Music, University of Georgia

Deanna Joseph, Associate Professor of Music and Director of Choral Activities, Georgia State University

Southern Methodist University Advanced Choral Conducting Workshop

Pamela Elrod Huffman, Associate Professor of Music and Director of Choral Activities, Southern Methodist University

University of Michigan Choral Conducting Symposium

Eugene Rogers, Director of Choirs and Conductor of Chamber Choir, University of Michigan

What are the benefits of an intensive workshop opportunity?



DANIEL BARA: Watching the progress of the conductors in the conducting master class from a Monday to a Wednesday or Thursday is amazing. It is truly amazing to see the participants experiment with new ideas and instruction and to see the metamorphosis over the course of the week. We try to give each conductor podium time every day so they can practice new techniques throughout the week. This is something that just cannot be done in one session. Also, the discussions we have develop out of response to the conducting master classes or other sessions. These discussions tend to take on a life of their own by the end of the workshop. As more people are participating, more ideas are shared. The more ideas that are shared, the conductors start putting things together and asking more questions. By the end of the week, everyone is engaged and seeking out more information and ideas.

WORKSHOPS FOR EARLY-CAREER CHORAL CONDUCTORS



DEANNA JOSEPH: Those of us who participated in this type of workshop as young teachers or young conductors see the value. When I was at the Oregon Bach Festival, for example, I felt that I grew as a conductor in an entirely different way because of the structure, the amount of instructional time, and the podium time. Another benefit to the participants is receiving feedback and instruction from two instructors with different teaching styles. We see the world differently and this is a strength that we have to offer. We each present different lecture sessions and we alternate on conducting feedback. This also increases the chances of diagnosing an issue in the gesture and finding a method or approach that will effectively communicate the solution.



PAMELA ELROD HUFFMAN: One benefit of the workshop setting is the community. We decompress as a group at the end of the day, and professional relationships are inevitably established. The career path we have chosen is relationship oriented. I remain close friends with other conductors who started their careers around the same time I started mine. The workshop participants are establishing their village and, with a small group, they can accomplish this rather easily. I love it when we have a mix of conductors with some at an earlier stage of their career and others who are more experienced. Everyone has bad habits, and you build camaraderie by having this in common and working together and supporting each other. As a result, mentor-mentee relationships are established. Intimacy and immediacy of relationships creates more opportunities for learning.

One of the aspects of our workshop that is beneficial is the fact that we cap the enrollment so that everyone is ensured of ample time on the podium. Conductors are up there every day, typically more than once. They get a lot of practical application during this time. Having enough time on the podium to apply the skills and topics discussed and to start playing in your new sandbox is very important. You then start to see immediate results through the video review. This aspect of selective enrollment and small class size is extremely helpful in this regard.



EUGENE ROGERS: You are dealing with the difference between exposure versus immersion. An immersive musical experience, just like in studying a new language, is always more rigorous, more rich, and more in depth. As a participant experiences our immersive symposium, they see and interact with the same peers every day and see growth, not only in themselves, but in the other conductors as well. What we do in our time together involves so much—the ear, the mind, and the body. It is a workshop designed to work all three areas every day, creating a deeper, more immersive experience. This is the difference—personally revisiting topics covered, working on skills, coming back to them—this repetition and day-to-day rigor is more immersive and gets a stronger result.

From your experience, what skills and concepts are important for early-career choral music educators to strengthen and improve?



DANIEL BARA: Rehearsal techniques and choral tone. Deanna and I are both eager to have our students “move the needle” as fast as possible in the rehearsal. Get the sound to change. It is about quickly determining what needs to be fixed and doing everything we can as creatively as possible to get something to change quickly. We try to espouse this practice as an aesthetic so conductors are focused on making change, improving the ensemble sound or accuracy, as quickly as possible. So we discuss language that we can employ and techniques we can use to get the job done.

For the early-career conductor, they are still finding their confidence and building their tool belt of techniques. Therefore, we try to share our tool belt a bit. For rehearsal technique, we start with a presentation and discussion of the general aesthetics over what constitutes good rehearsal technique, and what are elements of poor rehearsal technique. We discuss the hierarchy of rehearsal elements—pitch, rhythm, diction, and so on—and how we combine them in the learning and teaching process. Then we discuss the diagnosis pro-

cess and how to quickly address what we hear, identify, isolate, and fix the issues, and put things back together. I put it into the terms of always knowing where you are in the rehearsal process between now and the perfect recording. A conductor with strong rehearsal technique knows what they should listen for and what tools to implement throughout this entire process.

To cover the topic of choral tone, I talk about some of the warmups and activities I do when I am meeting with a guest choir or my own choir at the beginning of the year. Then we discuss the realities and challenges of choral singing. This includes the ranges of each section and the ensuing issues. For example, a discussion on what the choral soprano sound should be and how we can find this sound, or the challenge of the tenor sound in the upper range and balancing this with the alto section. Part of it is just an acknowledgment of the challenges of choral singing and coming to some basic rules of singing in a choir. We are striving for a sound that is elegant and does not sound forced or strained. We talk a lot about resonance like *chiaroscuro*—brightness and darkness—and the balance between these elements. We discuss what the voice naturally wants to do at the upper register versus the lower register. We delve into vowel modification and elements of diction that can help serve vocal technique and airflow. We try to identify some of these things in the repertoire to reinforce during the conducting master classes as well.



DEANNA JOSEPH: From a gestural standpoint, every conductor is inexperienced after graduating with just two semesters of conducting. One item I talk about is teaching mode versus conducting mode.

Many times, young teacher-conductors do not differentiate between these two roles. Then, after their first couple years of teaching, they forget what they learned in conducting class and develop bad rehearsal habits. In our institute, we give the conductors more practical practice with the rudiments of conducting gesture and how to quickly solve problems. We talk about how to know where you are in the rehearsal process and to avoid letting your teaching mode sneak into your polished performance version of conducting gesture.

Giving the participants space to practice in front

of an ensemble with feedback and then talking about these issues in order to increase awareness is extremely helpful. The podium time during the institute provides more opportunities for being in conducting mode because the choir is made up of professional singers who come with the music prepared. The conductors make this mental differentiation throughout the week so they can focus on refining their gesture. When in teaching mode, many of us are not thinking about our gesture. We are walking all over the place and coaching the ensemble. Then, as the singers are able to look up, we make the mental shift to begin presenting the most refined elegant version of our conducting mode.

At the institute, we provide the conducting fellows opportunities and feedback to discover what conducting mode looks like and feels like in the body. Then they will hopefully be able to recognize and recreate this sensation back in their own rehearsal hall and on stage in performance. Additionally, the community element allows the participants to keep in touch with each other and with us. This network and community of support is a meaningful connection for new teachers.



PAMELA ELROD HUFFMAN: One of the issues, particularly with someone who is just coming out of an undergraduate program, is the lack of experience as a conductor and not being settled in technique.

Having taken, typically, two semesters of conducting, they may not yet have the coordination or the arsenal of tools that experienced conductors gain over time. This is an important factor because when you do not trust your technique, you begin to rely on other things such as constantly talking in rehearsal or trying to do too much. This results in the ensemble receiving more information than is helpful when what they need is clarity.

Lack of experience, not only as a conductor but as a teacher, provides a lot of opportunity for growth. Our workshop addresses this by immediately getting the conductors on the podium. Participants are assigned pieces from the repertoire list beforehand and are expected to study and mark their scores for the first day. At the first conducting session, we watch to see

WORKSHOPS FOR EARLY-CAREER CHORAL CONDUCTORS

where they are and set initial expectations. We have two instructors who have had similar paths and are very compatible in their teaching styles and philosophies. The participants gain the advantage of hearing feedback from two different angles. Sometimes we are seeing the same thing but addressing it differently, and while my approach may not make sense to the conductor, Robert's might click or vice versa. The initial diagnostic is to see what the conductor is doing and immediately make a list of what is getting in the way.

One of the great things about being in a workshop is being able to not only get on the podium and bear your insecurities and take risks, but also to watch and learn from others.

Then we look at the score marking because this tells us to what degree they can unpack a score, which leads to the score study discussion with the whole group. As soon as possible we want to get into what the individual issues are and teach them the way we would teach our students.

Conductors in their early career also often do not feel centered or comfortable in front of a group. They may lack the ability to clear their mind and think about what they are going to say next, or assess what is coming up in the music that they need to anticipate in their gesture. Being able to predict what is going to happen comes with experience. Nothing can replace experience, but participating in a group learning experience with conductors from various levels and diverse musical backgrounds is helpful. In these settings, through group discussion, participants find out that everyone is insecure about something. Conductors with less experience might have a longer list of insecurities, but even conductors with more experience still have insecurities. This gives a participant permission to say, "Okay, nobody has all the answers so it is okay that I do not have all the answers." Then you have an instant village of people who are helping and supporting your

growth as you are supporting theirs. If you can clear out some of the voices that get in the way of learning and feel safe, you are put at ease right away so learning and growing occur.

Musicianship is also important. Are you a solid enough musician to be able to lead? Or are you following an accompanist or a rehearsal track? Are you a solid enough musician to walk in and know the music better than anybody else in the room? Conductors need an effective, thorough method of score study and analysis where they make all the decisions about the piece before they walk into the room. Regardless of the difficulty or complexity, know how you are going to go about teaching it. What goes along with musicianship is preparation, so the more we can help our participants learn and discover new ways to prepare, the better.

Dr. Bode and I both are firm believers that good musicianship comes from a solid foundation of music literacy. We stress that conductors need to have a technique, a plan, and a dependable procedure that works. The great thing about the Robert Shaw techniques is you are not trying to do everything at once. First you need to know the piece—know the structure, know what you want out of the piece, and make decisions about every aspect. Then you can disseminate this information efficiently and build the skills to gradually shift accountability from the podium to the ensemble, so you are not forced to do it all for them.

If there is one thing that you see with young professionals, and I was guilty of it too, you get in the rehearsal and you are so desperate to help that you just start doing it all for them. Over-conducting, lunging, singing with them, mouthing the words—these things are not helpful and add more confusion than clarity. So the idea of building accountability and transferring accountability is an important aspect of Shaw's techniques. You can learn a lot in an hour about a rehearsal procedure, and then you can appropriate that into your own methods and setting. One of the great things about being in a workshop is being able to not only get on the podium and bear your insecurities and take risks, but also to watch and learn from others.



EUGENE ROGERS: There are four main areas new teachers generally need to strengthen. Three of these relate to musical training, and the fourth is classroom management. Strengthening the three musical areas helps with classroom management. In many situations, issues with managing a choral rehearsal, are due to the lack of appropriate musicianship and pedagogical skills. Strong musicianship should be all encompassing. It is both an understanding of the notation reading tradition and the oral tradition. It should include the ability to change the way one presents the learning and exposure to music. It should also include a knowledge of the physicality of singing and conducting.

Building this broad level of musicianship that encapsulates multiple approaches is important for teachers of any level. This is why we include Dalcroze training in our symposium. It is also strengthened through daily sight reading and the practice of score study. We have a score study session the first day with tips about how to analyze a score, introducing or reminding them of techniques that they can use throughout the week on the repertoire they are conducting. Additional musicianship training comes from instructors demonstrating exercises that the participants may use with their own ensembles in order to build ensemble skills.

The second area is repertoire knowledge. We focus on not just the new but also utilize “tried and true” pieces so that young conductors can learn about a wide range of repertoire. The beauty of partnering with Hal Leonard is we have, what I call, daily “hymnals” that include a large quantity of repertoire that is both new music and pieces selected by the instructors. We have a full list of repertoire including the reading packets and the pieces prepared for the conducting portion of the symposium. Participants will not conduct every piece on the list, but watching their peers conduct, singing in the lab choir, and learning from observing the various feedback is very beneficial.

We also study a choral-orchestral masterwork of a traditional concert composer to expose the conductors to the depth of musicianship that a work of this magnitude requires. Participants study the full score—voices, strings, woodwinds, brass, percussion—and we chal-

lenge them to think about style and the gestural technique that one needs to be able to conduct and lead an ensemble of musicians they may not know. Even if the conductor is not programming masterworks every season, church choir directors tend to bring in instrumentalists periodically, and high school and middle school teachers will hopefully combine with their wind and orchestral colleagues. They should be able to feel comfortable in these situations. These are skills they may not need every day, but it challenges them to think about the depth of musicianship that is developed, and an understanding of performance practice and style that we all can improve.

The third area is overall pedagogical technique. We explore some of the “tried and true” pedagogical techniques and tips. This is why we have sessions such as working with treble voices, working with lower voices, dealing with cultural appropriation, discussing underrepresented voices that we need to know and how can we have this conversation with our singers. We try to introduce twenty-first-century topics that we as conductors will need to face and address in the classroom that are perhaps different than we experienced in our undergraduate training. We find it important to expose our participants to pedagogical techniques and skills to address these various topics.

The fourth area is classroom management. While we cannot address all of the issues in managing a choral classroom, many of the topics we address do relate. We demonstrate different approaches for different types of learners using the Dalcroze approach. We also introduce rote songs conductors can use as warmups or group gathering songs. This allows them to witness different types of approaches. If they have a class or ensemble where the students are rebelling against notation reading, these are exercises and songs to get them engaged.

WORKSHOPS FOR EARLY-CAREER CHORAL CONDUCTORS

What is the layout of your institute?



DEANNA JOSEPH: The Atlanta Conducting Institute is a five-day experience, Monday through Friday. We cover a number of topics through instructor-led presentations and discussions. In the af-

ternoon, all institute participants—conducting fellows and auditors—sing in a choir with a group of additional professional singers. Each of the conducting fellows receives podium time with this ensemble on an assortment of repertoire. Toward the end of the week we have a music vendor, Beethoven & Company, present to sell texts, scores, conducting batons, and other resources we have discussed over the course of the week. The end of the week also includes a reading session covering works appropriate for middle school, high school, and church choir. We also plan a social evening of dining for all participants and singers to simply relax and have fun.



DANIEL BARA: The topics we cover in the morning sessions include a general discussion about our aesthetic approach to gesture. This is a refresher of the fundamentals of conducting and what we be-

lieve to be the technical reasons why the basics are the basics. There is usually a more specific session on gesture that includes problem solving difficult spots within the repertoire from the afternoon conducting master classes. Score study and score marking is another topic. We use this discussion to connect how what we discover in the score shapes rehearsal technique. That leads to a broader discussion on rehearsal technique. We also have guest presentations such as a session on vocal technique from the voice teacher's perspective. Discussion then leads to vocal-choral techniques from the choral conductor's perspective, where we talk about warmups, aesthetics, and techniques. Another guest session covers movement in the choral rehearsal and ways to incorporate that fluidly. That is an interactive, kinesthetic, experiential type session where everyone learns by trying. We also do a session on the choral conductor

in front of an orchestra, working with instruments and instrumentalists and some of the “do’s and don’ts” of those situations.

The repertoire for the conducting sessions typically includes some majors works, possibly some accompanied recitative for advanced conductors, and octavos accessible for immediate use in the participants’ classrooms regardless of level.



PAMELA ELROD HUFFMAN: The Southern Methodist University Advanced Choral Conducting Workshop is a three-day experience that is organized and co-run by myself and Dr. Robert Bode. We

generally work on approximately eight pieces of music covering a variety of stylistic periods and difficulty levels. We always include one or two movements from an accessible choral-orchestral work. For example, the Schubert *Mass in G* or Mozart’s *Coronation Mass*—a masterwork the conductors can get into pretty easily and also something they may have the opportunity to program at some point in their careers. For each session, we begin with either a guided round table discussion or a presentation and then move into a conducting master class. Each conductor spends a lot of time on the podium conducting and receiving feedback from both instructors. We videotape each session, upload it to a folder, and the participants are expected to review their video and return the following day prepared to talk about what they observed. We end each day across the street at the hotel restaurant as an important time to decompress and review the day, as well as create a sense of community.

The network created is one of the best things about the workshop. During the day, other than the conducting master classes, we always include some aspect of score study techniques. This tends to show an inequality between what young conductors and seasoned professionals bring to the table. We usually include a discussion on working with orchestras, at times including a conducting session with a string quartet that serves as a demonstration group. We also include sessions on conducting and rehearsal techniques. I will lead a discussion on the Robert Shaw rehearsal techniques and warmups. Some important topics, like score study, we

include every year, but sometimes we will add new sessions such as programming, or the process of commissioning a work. The conducting master classes are an opportunity for the conductors to receive feedback on their gestural communication. We want to see what things they are doing well in terms of clear communication and what things might be confusing the issue.



EUGENE ROGERS: The University of Michigan Choral Conducting Symposium has been offered for around fifteen years. It was originally started by my former colleague, Jerry Blackstone. I have continued to expand it during my tenure as director of choirs. The goal of our program is to provide training for public school teachers, church choir directors, and aspiring graduate students. Workshop participants study a range of topics, smaller choral works and octavos, and also excerpts from a major work with depth. Each of the five days typically begins with a reading session followed by a topic session or discussion. Then we break out into smaller conducting classes before coming back together for more sessions.

Symposium participants conduct every day, sometimes twice a day, in a conducting master class format with me, Mark Stover, or Julie Skadsem. Every day the participants receive a reading packet, distributed through Hal Leonard, so they are exposed to new repertoire for all voice types and levels appropriate for church, community, or school. Every summer we bring in a composer-in-residence through our partnership with Hal Leonard. Rene Clausen has been a composer-in-residence, for example, and the summer of 2021 will feature Rollo Dilworth. The composer spends a day with the symposium participants working on his or her music and various pedagogical approaches to repertoire. This day ends with a community sing of this repertoire, which is open to the entire Ann Arbor community. Session topics and discussions include score study, Dalcroze techniques, working with treble voices, working with lower voices, social justice issues, and African and African American repertoire.

We intentionally give the evenings off so that participants can use this time to build a community and work together to support each other's learning. This

also gives participants time to practice and digest the material from the day. This time is equally important as the time we spend during the day. It is a non-auditioned program, and it is designed to be open to participants of all levels. We try to have each participant conduct as often as possible and create an environment that is open and supportive so that, regardless of level or previous experience, each conductor finds the type of rigor they are looking for in this summer program.

What non-academic benefits have you observed from your institute?



DANIEL BARA: The fact that everyone recognizes one another as a part of the resource and benefit of the week. They start to see each other as a meaningful connection and a meaningful resource.

They connect and ask questions, for example, "You have a middle school program? What were your five best pieces this year?" Creating and cultivating this environment is a valuable benefit.



DEANNA JOSEPH: Some people have a fear of getting in front of their peers and conducting but the supportive environments of institutes can provide confidence for people who are worried about

their gesture or feel too inexperienced as teachers. The participants all encourage one another and create a good feeling in the room. This benefits the growth and learning of the conductors.



PAMELA ELROD HUFFMAN: Workshop participants experience some level of emotional recharge. There is so much affirmation from this sort of experience.

It has to be an intentional design on the part of the people who are teaching. This is the basis of the way I teach, through affirmation and not through negativity, and Robert is the same way. Because as soon as you feel like you are being helped and supported and there are no mistakes, the learning can

WORKSHOPS FOR EARLY-CAREER CHORAL CONDUCTORS

happen much more easily.

Conductors come out of our workshop feeling like they learned new ideas and were challenged, but they do not come out injured or with battle scars. I think everyone deserves this approach because our own self-judging is harsh enough. Our self-criticism of not being good enough, prepared enough, or not having the same resume as that person—this is a tough enough existence. This is particularly challenging for conductors at early stages of their careers because it is hard to fake confidence. When you have opportunities where you can improve in a supportive and positive atmosphere, and an environment that is built for success, you need to seize these opportunities.




EUGENE ROGERS: People are challenged to be better musicians. This, in turn, raises one's personal commitment to bring their absolute best to their singers when they return home. Seeing the love

that the participants exude from singing together is sometimes the most cathartic to our spirits and also renews our passion for what we do. The time in the evening where they come together as a group is also vital. An intergenerational community develops where a first-year teacher meets and connects with someone who has taught twenty-five years. What we do when we struggle together, learn together, and support each other as conductors and colleagues strips away age, race, religion, identity, and it brings us together. Hopefully we challenge people through some of our sessions to consider our impact as leaders. I hope people feel inspired to be more actively engaged in their community, whether that is dealing with social justice issues or seeing their students in such a way that they can be a better resource to them, regardless of their background.

Conclusion

The benefit of workshops are clearly evident. Beyond a singular, limited session, intensive opportunities allow the participant more time for reflection and discussion as well as extended hands-on learning activities. Furthermore, participants' networks are extend-

ed and lasting relationships are developed. As each of the interviewees pointed out, the mentor/mentee dynamic and a broad coalition of support is one of the most important byproducts, especially for early career conductors.

In a 2003 survey of music teachers in their first two years, researchers found that seeking help and advice from others was one of the most common and helpful tools to ease the transition from university pre-service education into the first stages of the teaching career.⁵ As a result, research has also found that mentorship can lead to a higher teacher retention rate.⁶ The more opportunities for positive collegial support, focused and active learning, and reinvigoration of musical passion will increase the likelihood of a successful start to a conductor's career and a positive impact on our field as a whole. 

NOTES

- ¹ Robert Schumann, *Advice to Young Musicians*, trans. Henry Hugo Pierson (Leipzig: J. Schuberth & Co., 1860) 34.
- ² Laura M. DeSimone, "Improving Impact Studies of Teachers' Professional Development: Toward Better Conceptualizations and Measures," *Educational Researcher* 38, No. 3 (2009): 184.
- ³ Alfredo Bautista, Xenia Yau, and Joanne Wong, "High-Quality Music Teacher Professional Development: A Review of the Literature," *Music Education Research* 19, No. 4 (2015): 457.
- ⁴ Ibid.
- ⁵ Kathryn Roulston, Roy Legette, and Sarah Trotman Womack, "Beginning Music Teachers' Perceptions of the Transition From University to Teaching in Schools," *Music Education Research* 7, No. 1 (2005): 73.
- ⁶ Elizabeth Eaton and Wendy Sisson, "Why Are New Teachers Leaving? The Case for Beginning-Teacher Induction and Mentoring," *ICF International Presidential Transition* (2008): 1-7, <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED532589.pdf>.